Intellectual Merit Criterion

Overall Assessment of Intellectual Merit

Good

Explanation to Applicant

The applicant shows a reasonably strong academic record, although perhaps not as strong as some of the other candidates. Applicant has a good background in research and has shown promise in terms of a manuscript submitted for publication as a 1st author. She appears to be able to work independently and develop new approaches.

Broader Impacts Criterion

Overall Assessment of Broader Impacts

Very Good

Explanation to Applicant

The proposed research is timely in terms of developing models which could be modified provide data on human impact on natural marine species. The applicant also proposes to develop educational methods based upon the research.

Summary Comments

This is a reasonable application, with a sound research strategy and good reference letters. The application could be improved with more evidence of activities related to education and outreach and the more thorough discussion of how the research models would impact conservation efforts in the marine environment.
Intellectual Merit Criterion

Overall Assessment of Intellectual Merit

Very Good

Explanation to Applicant

The applicant has a good academic record, which is competitive with the field. The applicant has a strong history of performing research and presenting it at regional and national conferences. The letters of support are very strong for this applicant.

Broader Impacts Criterion

Overall Assessment of Broader Impacts

Fair

Explanation to Applicant

BI were not well articulated in this proposal.

Summary Comments

The is a good likelihood that this student will succeed in graduate school. The proposal would have been strengthened with a greater contribution to BI.
Intellectual Merit Criterion

Overall Assessment of Intellectual Merit

Very Good

Explanation to Applicant

Creative plan, well-qualified applicant, strong likelihood of advancing knowledge, adequate resources, positive letters

Broader Impacts Criterion

Overall Assessment of Broader Impacts

Good

Explanation to Applicant

Underdeveloped

Summary Comments

A solid proposal